

### JUDICIAL COUNCIL OF CALIFORNIA

455 Golden Gate Avenue · San Francisco, California 94102-3688 www.courts.ca.gov

# REPORT TO THE JUDICIAL COUNCIL

For business meeting on September 24, 2019

**Title** 

**Criminal Procedure: Immigration** 

Consequences Advisement on Plea Forms

Rules, Forms, Standards, or Statutes Affected

Revise forms CR-101 and CR-102

Recommended by

Criminal Law Advisory Committee Hon. Tricia A. Bigelow, Chair **Agenda Item Type** 

Action Required

**Effective Date** 

January 1, 2020

**Date of Report** 

September 24, 2019

Contact

Eve Hershcopf, 415-865-7961 Eve.Hershcopf@jud.ca.gov

## **Executive Summary**

The Criminal Law Advisory Committee recommends amending the language in the immigration consequences section of two Judicial Council plea forms to conform to the plain language of Penal Code section 1016.5.

#### Recommendation

The Criminal Law Advisory Committee recommends that the Judicial Council, effective January 1, 2020, revise the immigration consequences advisement of *Plea Form, With Explanations and Waiver of Rights—Felony* (form CR-101) and *Domestic Violence Plea Form With Waiver of Rights—Misdemeanor* (form CR-102) to address concerns that the provision in each form contains inaccuracies, and to conform the provision to the plain language of Penal Code section 1016.5.

The revised forms are attached at pages 4–13.

#### **Relevant Previous Council Action**

The Judicial Council approved form CR-101, effective January 1, 2007, to provide increased uniformity in felony plea waiver forms used throughout the state. The immigration consequences

language from the original form has never been changed. Form CR-102 includes similar language about immigration consequences. This language has not changed since the form's approval, effective July 1, 2011.

### Analysis/Rationale

California law requires that, before acceptance of a plea of guilty or nolo contendere to any offense punishable as a crime under state law, except offenses designated as infractions, the court must administer the following advisement on the record to the defendant:

If you are not a citizen, you are hereby advised that conviction of the offense for which you have been charged may have the consequences of deportation, exclusion from admission to the United States, or denial of naturalization pursuant to the laws of the United States.

(Pen. Code, § 1016.5(a).)

The Judicial Council developed form CR-101 to provide increased uniformity in felony plea waiver forms used throughout the state. The form currently contains the following immigration advisement:

I understand that if I am not a citizen of the United States, my plea of guilty or no contest may or, with certain offenses, will result in my deportation, exclusion from reentry to the United States, and denial of naturalization and amnesty, and that the appropriate consulate may be informed of my conviction. The offenses that will result in such immigration action include, but are not limited to, an aggravated felony, conspiracy, a controlled substance offense, a firearm offense, and, under certain circumstances, a moral turpitude offense.

(Judicial Council form CR-101, item (3)(i), at p. 4, original emphasis.)

The committee recognized that, contrary to Penal Code section 1016.5, forms CR-101 and CR-102 inaccurately suggest that certain consequences "will" rather than "may" follow from certain guilty pleas. Thus, the committee recommends replacing the immigration advisement in forms CR-101 and CR-102 with the following language, derived from section 1016.5:

I understand that if I am not a citizen of the United States, my plea of guilty or no contest may result in my deportation, exclusion from admission to the United States, or denial of naturalization under the laws of the United States.

<sup>1</sup> The Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996 created unified "removal" proceedings in place of deportation and exclusion proceedings. (See *Vartelas v. Holder* (2012) 566 U.S. 257, 261.) Because Penal Code section 1016.5 was enacted before this change, it uses the earlier terminology. To conform with the Penal Code, this report and the proposed forms use the older terms of "deportation" and "exclusion."

#### **Policy implications**

The committee was concerned that by providing potentially inaccurate information in the immigration consequences advisement, these forms may discourage defendants from pleading to immigration-neutral offenses and create potential conflicts with accurate advice given by defense counsel. Thus, the committee recommends revising the advisement in forms CR-101 and CR-102 with language consistent with Penal Code section 1016.5.

#### **Comments**

This proposal circulated for comment from April 11 to June 10, 2019. Seven comments were received. Six commenters agreed with the proposal, including the Superior Courts of Los Angeles and San Diego Counties, the Orange County Bar Association (OCBA), and the Immigrant Legal Resource Center, which had originally brought this issue to the committee's attention. The Superior Court of Orange County did not indicate a position. The OCBA responded to the request for specific comments, including whether the attorney's declaration in forms CR-101 and CR-102 should be updated to include language about immigration consequences. The OCBA responded in the negative, noting that "[b]ecause defense attorneys have an affirmative duty to advise their clients of the collateral immigration consequences of the criminal case... a further affirmation that the attorney has advised the client of immigration consequences seems redundant."

#### Alternatives considered

The committee considered not undertaking revisions to forms CR-101 and CR-102 but recognized the importance in having the immigration consequences provision accurately reflect the language in Penal Code section 1016.5.

#### **Fiscal and Operational Impacts**

Expected costs are limited to possible case management system updates and the production of revised forms. No other implementation requirements or operational impacts are expected.

#### Attachments and Links

- 1. Forms CR-101 and CR-102, at pages 4–13
- 2. Chart of comments, at pages 14–17

|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   | 011 10   |
|---------------|--|---|------------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|-------------------|----------|
| SUP           | ERIOR COURT  | OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY   | )F                                 |                        |                       |                      | FOR COURT USE O     | NLY               |          |
| STRE          | EET ADDRESS:   |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| MAILI         | ING ADDRESS:   |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| CITY A        | AND ZIP CODE:  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| В             | RANCH NAME:  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| PEO           | PLE OF THE S   | TATE OF CALIFORNIA  |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  | ٧.  |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| Defe          | endant:  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| ы             | EA FORM V  | WITH EVEL ANATIONS  |                                    |                        | NITO FELONIV          | CASE NUMBER:         |                     |                   |          |
| PL            | EA FORM, V   | VITH EXPLANATIONS A   | AND WAIVE                          | ER OF RIC              | SHIS—FELONY           |                      |                     |                   |          |
| INST          | RUCTIONS:  | (1) Fill out this form only i   | f you want to                      | plead guilt            | y or no contest.      |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  | (2) Read this form careful initials in the box to the   | e right of the                     |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  | understand, leave the   |                                    | under "DEI             | TENDANITIC CTATE      | \                    |                     |                   |          |
|               |  | (3) On page 6, sign and d   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     | : 41.:            |          |
|               |  | (4) Keep in mind that the<br>form, ask your attorned  |                                    | give legal a           | advice. If you have a | ny questions         | about anything      | in this           |          |
| 4 6           | NIADOEC AN   | •   |                                    | :14                    |                       | !!\                  |                     |                   | INITIALS |
|               |  | <b>D MAXIMUM TERM.</b> I wan ed below. I understand that  |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     | dina              |          |
|               |  | test are listed below.  |                                    | and maxim              | iam penalace for the  | onargoo to           | minori i am pioac   | ****19            |          |
| Γ             | COUNT  | CHARGES   | YEARS /                            | MONTHS                 | PRIOR CONVICTIONS, EN |                      | YEARS / MONT        | 'HS               | TOTAL    |
|               | COUNT  | (SECTION & DESCRIPTION)   | MINIMUM                            | MAXIMUM                | (SECTION & DESC       |                      | MINIMUM MA          | XIMUM             | TIME     |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     | $\longrightarrow$ |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               |  |   |                                    |                        | AG                    | GREGATE MAXIN        | IUM TIME OF IMPRISO | NMENT             |          |
| s<br>h        | entence I will i<br>as explained t                         | MENT. I understand that I receive or the sentence reco  | ommendatio                         | ns that will l         | be made to the court  | . My attorney        | y, the court, or th | ne pros           | ecutor   |
|               | ne as follows:   |   | D: · · · · · ·                     |                        | · \                   |                      |                     |                   |          |
| а             | . Check one:<br>(1)  | `   |                                    |                        | stice) Cou            | nty Jail for         |                     |                   | INITIALS |
|               |  | years and:  | months o                           |                        | lar not more than:    | Vooro                | and mant            | ho                |          |
|               | (2) Not less than: years and: months and/or not more than: |   |                                    |                        |                       | years a              | and: mont           | ns.               |          |
| L-            | (3) Other (specify):                                       |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| D             | o. Probation   | Probation for: years under conditions to be set by the court, including days in the county jail or                            |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               | up to:   |   |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
|               | up to  | . aayo iii alo <b>oodi</b>  |                                    |                        |                       |                      |                     |                   |          |
| р<br><b>N</b> | rogram, if orde<br><b>//aximum Tim</b>                     | at a violation of any of the or<br>ered by the court, may cause<br>e of Imprisonment" specif<br>170(h)(5)(B) if the court ser | se the court to<br>fied in item 1, | o send me<br>which may | to county jail or sta | <b>te prison</b> for | up to the "Agg      | regate            |          |

Page 1 of 7

Department of Motor Vehicles, and my vehicle may be ordered forfeited if it was involved in the offense.

(5) The consequences of this plea, including the immigration consequences; and

(6) Anything else I think is important to my case.

(c) (d)

(e)

(f)

(g)

Welfare investigator's declaration

Other (specify):

(Specify facts):

Court documents regarding any alleged prior offenses

|  | CASE NUMBER:   |
|--|--|
| Defendant(s):  |  |
|  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STA  | TEMENT   |
| I, having been duly sworn or having a written oath on file, certify that I truly blanguage noted below. The defendant stated that he or she understood the signed the form.  |  |
| Language: Spanish Other (specify):   |  |
| INTERPRETER'S SIGNATURE  | DATE   |
| INTERPRETER'S NAME (TYPE OR PRINT)   |  |
| DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S S  | TATEMENT   |
| I have read this form and understand the terms of the plea agreement.  I agree do not agree with the terms of the plea agreem  | ent and the indicated sentence.  |
| ATTORNEY'S SIGNATURE   | DATE   |
| COURT'S FINDINGS AN  | ID ORDER   |
| The court, having reviewed this form (and any addenda), and having orally  | examined the defendant, finds as follows:  |
| 1. The defendant has read or has had read to him or her and understands  | each of the initialed items in this form.  |
| <ol><li>The defendant understands the nature of the crimes and allegations list<br/>the plea and any admissions.</li></ol>   | ed in item 1 (on page 1) and the consequences of   |
| 3. The defendant expressly, knowingly, understandingly, and intelligently v  | vaives his or her constitutional and statutory rights.   |
|  |  |
| 4. The defendant's plea, admissions, and waiver of rights are made freely  | and voluntarily.   |
|  |  |
| <ol> <li>The defendant's plea, admissions, and waiver of rights are made freely</li> <li>A factual basis exists for the plea and admissions, or the defendant is pleast.</li> <li>The court accepts the defendant's plea, admissions, and waiver of rights, at thereon.</li> </ol> | leading pursuant to a plea bargain under <i>People v.</i>  |
| <ol> <li>A factual basis exists for the plea and admissions, or the defendant is pleast.</li> <li>The court accepts the defendant's plea, admissions, and waiver of rights, and</li> </ol>   | leading pursuant to a plea bargain under <i>People v.</i> nd the defendant is hereby convicted based |

|             |   |   |  |   |  | CR-102      |  |  |
|-------------|---|---|--|---|--|-------------|--|--|
|             |   | COURT OF CALIFORI   | NIA, COUNTY OF   |   | FOR COURT USE ONLY   |             |  |  |
| STRE        | ET ADDRE  | ESS:  |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| MAILI       | NG ADDRE  | ESS:  |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| CITY A      | ND ZIP CC   | DDE:  |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| BF          | RANCH NA  | ME:   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| PEOF        | PLE OF  | THE STATE OF CALIFOR  | NIA  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   | ٧.  |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| Defe        | ndant(s   | s):   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   | DOMESTIC  | C VIOLENCE PLEA FOR  | PM  | CASE NUMBER.   |             |  |  |
|             |   |   | OF RIGHTS—MISDEME  |   | CASE NUMBER:   |             |  |  |
| nstr        | uction  | ns:   |  |   |  | ,           |  |  |
| • F         | Read th<br>he right<br>Sign and<br>Keep in  | is form carefully. For ea<br>t of the item. For any ite<br>d date the form under "L | m that does not apply to yoเ<br>DEFENDANT'S STATEMEN                   | nd agree with what you re<br>I or that you do not under<br>IT" on page 3. | ead, put your initials in the box to<br>stand, leave the box blank.<br>re questions about anything in this | INITIALS    |  |  |
|             |   |   | i <b>es.</b> I want to plead guilty or<br>narges to which I am pleadii |   | listed below. I understand that listed below.  |             |  |  |
|             | COUNT   | (SECT   | CHARGES<br>ION & DESCRIPTION)  | MAX   | XIMUM PENALTY<br>(FINE & JAIL)   |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| _           |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| -           |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| _           |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| _<br>P      | rior Co   | nvictions. I understand   | that I am also charged with  | a prior conviction in case  | e number(s):   |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| 8. P        | robatio   | on Violations. I underst  | and that I am also charged v   | with a violation of probatio  | n in case number(s):   |             |  |  |
|             |   |   |  | ,,                                  |  |             |  |  |
| m           | Right to an Attorney (Leave this box blank if you have an attorney). I understand that I have the right to an attorney of my choice to represent me throughout the proceedings. If I cannot afford to hire an attorney, the court will appoint one to represent me. I hereby give up my right to be represented by an attorney.                     |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| 5. <b>O</b> | Other Constitutional Rights. I understand that I am entitled to each of the following rights concerning the charges and prior convictions (if any) listed in items 1 and 2 (above):   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| ·           | <ul> <li>a. Right to a jury trial. I understand that I have a right to a speedy and public jury trial. At the trial, I would be presumed to be innocent and I could not be convicted unless, after hearing all of the evidence, 12 impartial jurors chosen from the community were convinced beyond a reasonable doubt that I am guilty.</li> </ul> |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
| b.          | Righ  | nt to confront and cros   | s-examine witnesses. I un  | derstand that I have the r  | ight to confront and cross-  |             |  |  |
|             |   |   | resence and I or my attorne  |   | st produce the witnesses in court  |             |  |  |
| C.          | c. <b>Right to remain silent and not incriminate myself.</b> I understand that I have the right to remain silent and my silence cannot be considered as evidence against me. I understand that I also have the right not to incriminate myself and I cannot be forced to testify.   |   |  |   |  |             |  |  |
|             | •   |   | -  |   |  | Page 1 of 3 |  |  |

**CR-102** PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA v. CASE NUMBER: Defendant(s): INITIALS 6. Rights for Probation Violations (Leave this box blank if you are not charged with a probation violation). I understand that I have all the constitutional rights listed above for all probation violations charged against me, except that I do not have a right to a jury trial, only a court hearing before a judge. 7. Consequences of My Plea a. No contest plea. I understand that a no contest plea has the same effect as a guilty plea except that it cannot be used against me in a civil case that derives from an act on which this prosecution is based unless the offense is punishable as a felony. b. Effect of conviction on other cases. I understand that a conviction in this case may be used to increase my punishment for future domestic violence convictions and may constitute a violation of any other current grant of parole or probation, which may result in additional punishment. Mandatory minimum conditions of probation. I understand that if I am granted probation, the terms and conditions will include at least all of the following (see Pen. Code, § 1203.097): (1) A minimum of either 36 months (3 years) or 48 months (4 years) of probation; (2) A criminal court protective order that may include residence exclusion or stay-away conditions; (3) Booking within one week of sentencing if I have not already been booked; (4) Several statutory fines, fees, and assessments, including a domestic violence fee, restitution fine, probation revocation fine (stayed), criminal conviction assessment, and court security fee; (5) Successful completion of an appropriate batterer's treatment program lasting at least 52 weeks; (6) Community service; (7) Restitution to the victim (if applicable); (8) An order to not own, possess, purchase, or receive any firearms; (9) An order to relinquish any firearms in my possession or control; and (10) Other: Effect of future probation violation. I understand that if I violate any of the terms or conditions of probation, I may be returned to court and sentenced up to the maximum punishment on each charge as indicated in item 1. Immigration consequences. I understand that if I am not a citizen of the United States, my plea of guilty or no contest may result in my deportation, exclusion from admission to the United States, or denial of naturalization pursuant to the laws of the United States. Firearm prohibition. I understand that a conviction in this case may prohibit me from owning, using, or possessing firearms and ammunition within 10 years under Penal Code sections 29805 and 30305. Child custody consequences. I understand that a conviction in this case may result in a rebuttable presumption that an award of sole or joint physical or legal custody of a child is detrimental to the best interest of the child under Family Code section 3044. h. Other consequences (specify): 8. Before the Plea a. Discussion with my attorney (Leave this box blank if you are not represented by an attorney). Before entering this plea, I have had a full opportunity to discuss with my attorney the facts of the case, the elements of the charged offenses and prior convictions (if any), any defenses that I may have, my constitutional and statutory rights and waiver of those rights, the consequences of this plea, and anything else I think is important to my case. b. Questions. I have no further questions for the court or for my attorney with regard to my plea and admissions in this case or any of my rights or anything else on this form.

CR-102 [Rev. January 1, 2020]

incriminating myself with my plea.

10. The Plea (check one). I freely and voluntarily plead

to convince me to plead guilty or no contest.

GUILTY

NO CONTEST

to the

9. **Waiver of Constitutional Rights.** For each of the charges, prior convictions (if any), and probation violations (if any) listed in items 1, 2, and 3, I give up my right to a jury trial, my right to a court hearing, my right to confront and cross-examine witnesses, and my right to remain silent and not to incriminate myself. I understand that I am, in fact,

charges listed in item 1. I offer my plea with full understanding of everything in this form. No one has made any threats; used any force against me, my family, or loved ones; or made any promises to me, except as listed in this form, in order

| Defendant(s):   | CASE NUMBER:  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|
|   |   |  |  |  |  |
| 11. Prior Convictions. I freely and voluntarily admit the prior convictions (if any) listed admission may increase the penalties that are imposed on me.  | INITIALS I in item 2, and I understand that this  |  |  |  |  |
| 12. <b>Probation Violations.</b> I freely and voluntarily admit the probation violations (if any  | ) listed in item 3.   |  |  |  |  |
| 3. <b>Sentencing.</b> I understand that I have a right to delay my sentencing at least 6 hours and as long as 5 days after my plea. I give up this right and agree to be sentenced at this time.  |   |  |  |  |  |
| DEFENDANT'S STATEMENT   |   |  |  |  |  |
| I have read or have had read to me this form and have initialed each of the items I have discussed each item with my attorney. By putting my initials next to the it understand and agree with what is stated in each item that I have initialed. The reflects of any prior convictions and probation violations have been explained outlined above and I give up each of them to enter my plea.  | ems in this form, I am indicating that I nature of the charges, possible defenses, and  |  |  |  |  |
| Defendant's Signature   | Date  |  |  |  |  |
| ATTORNEY'S STATEMENT  |   |  |  |  |  |
| I am the attorney of record for the defendant. I have reviewed this form with my client. including the defendant's constitutional and statutory rights, to the defendant and have to those rights, the other items in this form, and the plea agreement. I have also discuss have explained the nature and elements of each charge, any possible defenses to the probation violations, and the consequences of the plea.  | e answered all of his or her questions with regard ssed the facts of the case with the defendant and  |  |  |  |  |
|   |   |  |  |  |  |
| Attorney's Signature  | Date  |  |  |  |  |
| Attorney's Signature  INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT   | Date  |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or having interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant states   | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly   |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or having interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.   | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly   |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or havin interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.  | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly   |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or having interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.  Language: Spanish Other (specify):   | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly ted that he or she understood the contents on the   |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or having interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.  Language: Spanish Other (specify):  Interpreter's Signature  COURT'S FINDINGS AND ORDER  The court, having reviewed this form and having orally examined the defendant, finds understands each of the initialed items on this form; (b) the defendant understands the items 1, 2, and 3 and the consequences of the plea and any admissions; (c) the defendant intelligently waives his or her constitutional and statutory rights; and (d) the defendant                        | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly ted that he or she understood the contents on the  Date  that (a) the defendant has read or been read and a nature of the crimes and allegations listed in dant expressly, knowingly, understandingly, and  |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or havin interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.  Language: Spanish Other (specify):  Interpreter's Signature  COURT'S FINDINGS AND ORDER  The court, having reviewed this form and having orally examined the defendant, finds understands each of the initialed items on this form; (b) the defendant understands the items 1, 2, and 3 and the consequences of the plea and any admissions; (c) the defendant intelligently waives his or her constitutional and statutory rights; and (d) the defendant freely and voluntarily. | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly ted that he or she understood the contents on the  Date  that (a) the defendant has read or been read and e nature of the crimes and allegations listed in dant expressly, knowingly, understandingly, and is plea, admissions, and waiver of rights are made   |  |  |  |  |
| INTERPRETER'S STATEMENT  I: , having been duly sworn or havin interpreted this form to the defendant in the language noted below. The defendant state form and then initialed and signed the form.  Language: Spanish Other (specify):  Interpreter's Signature   | ng a written oath on file, certify that I truly ted that he or she understood the contents on the  Date  that (a) the defendant has read or been read and a nature of the crimes and allegations listed in dant expressly, knowingly, understandingly, and is plea, admissions, and waiver of rights are made endant is hereby convicted based thereon. |  |  |  |  |

# **SPR19-16**

## **Immigration Consequences Explanation on Plea Forms** (CR-101, CR-102)

|    | Commenter  | Position | Comment  | Committee Response  |
|----|--|----------|--|---------------------|
| 1. | Immigrant Legal Resource Center<br>by Rose Cahn, Criminal and<br>Immigrant Justice Attorney<br>San Francisco, California | A        | These proposed changes resolve the inaccurate information in the prior version of the model plea form. This is a welcome and needed change.  | No response needed. |
| 2. | Legal Services for Prisoners with<br>Children<br>by Aila Ferguson, Staff Attorney<br>Oakland, California                 | A        | It is a matter of human rights that people signing plea deals have all relevant information given to them at the time of signing. Including this check box is one necessary step toward that goal. | No response needed. |
| 3. | Lily Harvey<br>Oakland, California   | A        | No specific comment.   | No response needed. |

# **SPR19-16 Immigration Consequences Explanation on Plea Forms** (CR-101, CR-102)

|    | Commenter  | Position | Comment  | Committee Response   |
|----|--|----------|--|--|
| 4. | Orange County Bar Association<br>by Deirdre Kelly, President | A        | Does the proposal appropriately address the stated purpose? Yes. Amending the immigration advisement to conform with Penal Code section 1016.5, assures that defendants will not be given incorrect statements of law by the court and eliminates the risk present under the old advisement of telling defendants they will be subject to deportation when their attorneys have in fact determined that will not be a potential consequence.   | No response needed.  |
|    |  |          | Does the language conform to the statue and remove inaccuracies? If not what language would do so?  The language tracks Penal Code section 1016.5 and is therefore an accurate statement of law.  Does the language sufficiently parallel the rest of the plea form stylistically?  Yes.   | <ul> <li>No response needed.</li> <li>No response needed.</li> </ul> |
|    |  |          | Should the attorney's declaration on both forms be updated to include language about immigration consequences specifically? If so, what language should be included?  No. The "Attorney's Statement" on the plea forms already requires the attorney to affirm that he or she has reviewed the consequences of the plea with the client. Because defense attorneys have an affirmative duty to advise their clients of the collateral immigration consequences of the criminal case (Padilla v. Kentucky (2010) 559 U.S. 356, 375) a further | The committee appreciates the comment.                               |

# **SPR19-16**

## **Immigration Consequences Explanation on Plea Forms** (CR-101, CR-102)

|    | Commenter   | Position | Comment   | Committee Response   |
|----|---|----------|---|--|
|    |   |          | affirmation that the attorney has advised of the client of immigration consequences seems redundant.  |  |
| 5. | Superior Court of Los Angeles County (no name provided) | A        | Does the proposal appropriately address the stated purpose? Yes, the proposal addresses the stated purpose.  Does the language conform to the statute and remove inaccuracies? If not, what language would do so? Yes, the language conforms to the statute and removes inaccuracies.  Does the language sufficiently parallel the rest of the plea form stylistically? Yes, the language is sufficient.  The advisory committee also seeks comments from courts on the following cost and implementation matters: Would the proposal provide cost savings? If so, please quantify. We do not anticipate cost savings.  What would the implementation requirements be for courts—for example, training staff (please identify position and expected hours of training), revising processes and procedures | <ul> <li>No response needed.</li> <li>No response needed.</li> <li>No response needed.</li> <li>No response needed.</li> </ul> |

# **SPR19-16 Immigration Consequences Explanation on Plea Forms** (CR-101, CR-102)

|    | Commenter  |    | Comment   | Committee Response  |  |
|----|--|----|---|---------------------|--|
|    |  |    | (please describe), or modifying case management systems? Implementation requirements include changing the case management system to reflect the new language. Also, new forms (CR-101 and CR-102) will need to be ordered and distributed.        | No response needed. |  |
|    |  |    | Would three months from Judicial Council approval of this proposal until its effective date provide sufficient time for implementation? Six months would be preferred to give our technology staff sufficient time to make the necessary changes. | No response needed. |  |
| 6. | Superior Court of Orange County (no name provided)                     | NI | No response required. This is not a mandatory form and we have our own local tahl forms. However, if a change is finalized the information may be considered for inclusion in our local forms.  | No response needed. |  |
| 7. | Superior Court of San Diego County<br>by Mike Roddy, Executive Officer | A  | No additional comment.  | No response needed. |  |